

Bechoros – Simanim

פרק ג – הלוקח בהמה

דף כג – Daf 23

1. Can nullified *tumah* still be *metamei* with משא?

On the previous Daf, Amoraim discussed if nullified *tumah* can be “reawakened” if it becomes the majority. A Mishnah teaches that if אפר כשר – *valid ashes* of the פרה אדומה were mixed with אפר מקלה – *ashes of ordinary burning*, we follow the majority of ashes regarding *tumah*. If the majority is אפר מקלה, the mixture is not *metamei*. The Gemara asks: ואי אמרת טומאה כמאן דאיתיה דמי – *but if you say nullified tumah is considered present* insofar as it can be “reawakened,” נהי דבמגע לא מטמא – *then granted [the ash mixture] cannot be metamei through touching*, because we can say he did not touch the *tamei* component, but מטמא במשא – *let it be metamei through being carried*, since the entire mixture was carried at once!? The Gemara replies that Rebbe Yose bar Rebbe Chanina indeed said that it is *metamei* with משא. A similar question is asked about Rav Chisda’s ruling that בטל meat is בטל in a mixture of *shechted* meat, and is not *metamei*. Although it is not *metamei* with מגע, it should still be *metamei* with משא!? The same answer is given.

2. *metamei* until it is no longer fit for “consumption” – two opinions

Amoraim debate when בילה meat ceases to be *metamei*. Bar Padda says: טומאה חמורה – *neveilah* can transmit “stringent *tumah*,” i.e., by being carried, עד לגר – *until* it is no longer fit to be consumed by a human “resident,” but it can transmit קלה טומאה – *lenient tumah*, i.e., through touching, עד לכלב – *until* it is no longer fit to be consumed by a dog. Rebbe Yochanan: אחת זו ואחת זו עד לכלב – *both [the tumah of מגע and משא] are until* it is no longer fit for a dog. Bar Padda *darshens*: לא תאכלו כל נבלה לגר וגו' – *you shall not eat any neveilah; to the resident, etc.*, teaching: הראויה הראויה – *that which is fit for a resident is called neveilah*, but that which is not ראויה לגר is not called *neveilah*. Rebbe Yochanan holds that this *passuk* is מעיקרא היכא דהסריחה – *to exclude where it was decomposed from the beginning*, and was never *metamei*. Bar Padda replies that no *passuk* is necessary to exclude *neveilah* meat which was always decomposed, because עפרא בעלמא הוא – *it is like mere earth*, and is obviously not *metamei*.

3. *עמי הארץ* are suspected of adding מחצה of water into their ציר

The previous Daf taught that if one purchased ציר – *fish brine* from an *עם הארץ*, it becomes *tahor* through השקה – *contact* with *mikveh* waters (even though its majority may be water, and thus susceptible to *tumah*). In a Mishnah, Rebbe Eliezer ben Yaakov said that if a minimal amount of water fell into such ציר – *fish brine*, it is ruled *tamei*. Rabbah bar Avuha explains: זאת אומרת נחשדו עמי הארץ לערב מחצה בציר – *this says that עמי הארץ are suspected of mixing an equal amount of water into their fish juice*. Once water is added and the water becomes the majority, the *tumah* is “reawakened.” The Gemara objects that even if the *עם הארץ* would add slightly less than half as much water, the additional water would make the total water content equal to the fish juice, and it would no longer be בטל! The Gemara emends Rabbah bar Avuha’s statement: עד מחצה *עמי הארץ* add *nearly an equal amount* of water, and equals the fish juice after more water is added. Alternatively, since the *tumah* of [food of] *עם הארץ* is only דרבנן, and the *tumah* of liquids is also only דרבנן, the ציר would not be *tamei* if it were equal parts water and fish juice.

Siman – Kugelach

The boy who became *tamei* through משא when he carried away a tray of בילה mixed in with *shechted* meat to clear space for his **kugelach** game, beside a dog refusing spoiled בילה that was no longer מטמא because it was unfit even for a dog, watched his friend dive to catch the **kugelach** and knock water into an *עם הארץ*’s fish brine, making water the majority and “reawakening” its טומאה.



The boy who became *tamei* through משא when he carried away a tray of נבילה mixed in with *shechted* meat to clear space for his *kugelach* game, beside a dog refusing spoiled נבילה that was no longer מטמא because it was unfit even for a dog, watched his friend dive to catch the *kugelach* and knock water into an עם הארץ's fish brine, making water the majority and "reawakening" its טומאה.

3 things to remember

1. Can nullified tumah still be metamei with משא?
2. נבילה is metamei until it is no longer fit for "consumption" – two opinions
3. עמי הארץ are suspected of adding מחצה of water into their ציר

